Observations on Empirical Computer Research

Walt Heimerdinger WG10.4 Meeting Obidos

Hypotheses are Important

- Set the scope of the inquiry
 - Determine what is relevant and what is not
 - Some details always will be omitted
- Many rationale sections miss the mark
 - Include rationale for effort but not for study decisions
- "Poor experimental methods impede scientific progress"

Constraints are Just as Important

- Helps understanding of omissions and commissions
- Helps potential users decide if results or data are relevant to them

Metrics

- Should match the hypothesis
- Should be measurable
- Should avoid bias for/against a particular approach

Statistical Studies Require Good Statistics

- Include statistician on the team
- Understand what statistical approaches are appropriate
 - Known shortfalls and advantages of alternatives
 - Knowledge of existing libraries

Evaluation Context

"Real World"

- Observations of external process
- Constrains type and quality of data
- Often limits ability to distribute data
- Ground truth may not be available
- "Artificial World"
 - Context is expensive to generate and reproduce
 - Stimuli must be high quality
 - Skill of human participants (e.g. Red Team)

People are VERY Difficult to Include

Demographics

- Match to population of interest
- Availability a major determinant
- Legal / Ethical constraints
 - Institutional Research Boards proscribe what can be done to a person
 - Personally Identifiable Information limitations limit distribution of data

Multi-Party Evaluation

- Extends evaluation
 - Integrates evaluation target in larger environment
 - Expands evaluation context in possibly unexpected directions
- Goals must be shared
 - How much independence is productive
 - Can be adversarial or cooperative
- Expensive

Sharing

Results

- Repeatability may/may not be important
 - Study may be single-point observation

How are results best communicated

- Short paper advertises results in summary form assumes follow-up by interested parties
- Experimental paper includes specific sections on experimental methodology
- Report with sufficient detail to reproduce the effort
- Executable framework to recreate and possible extend effort

Artifacts

Data

- Self-documenting e.g. with metadata
- Machine readable
- Anonymized
- Methodology
 - Specify controlled and uncontrolled variables
 - Use of accepted standards or libraries can help

Framework

- Flexibility
- Source code
- Documentation
 - Users guide

Instrumentation

- Testing and evaluation usually a small part of the budget
 - Data collection usually is expensive in time and effort
- Experiment context is part of the data
 - Need to capture metadata
- Benchmarks
 - Can provide common context
 - Can save enormous amount of effort
 - Scope of benchmark may not fit
 - Long-term relevance is difficult to maintain